

EXHIBIT A

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW
YORK, by Letitia James, Attorney General
of the State of New York,

Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF NEW YORK, MAYOR BILL DE
BLASIO, POLICE COMMISSIONER
DERMOT F. SHEA, and CHIEF OF
DEPARTMENT TERENCE A.
MONAHAN,

Defendants.

21-cv-322 (CM)(GWG)

**PLAINTIFF’S THIRD SUPPLEMENTAL SET OF REQUESTS FOR
PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS TO ALL DEFENDANTS**

Pursuant to Rules 26 and 34 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Rule 26.3 of the Local Civil Rules of the United States District Court for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York, plaintiff the People of the State of New York (“Plaintiff”) requests that defendants City of New York, Bill de Blasio, and Terence A. Monahan (“Defendants”), produce for examination, inspection and copying, within thirty (30) days of the service hereof, or such shorter time as the Court orders or that Plaintiff and Defendants (together, the “Parties”) stipulate, all documents described below at the New York State Office of the Attorney General, Civil Rights Bureau, 28 Liberty Street, 20th Floor, New York, New York 10005, or at such other place or time, or in such other manner, as the Parties mutually agree.

DEFINITIONS

1. Plaintiff incorporates by reference herein the Uniform Definitions in Discovery Requests set out in Rule 26.3(c) of the Local Civil Rules of the United States District Court for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York (the “Local Civil Rules”).

2. “2020 Racial Justice Protests” means the protests against police violence occurring in New York City between May 28, 2020 and February 12, 2021, including but not limited to those protests listed in the attached Amended Schedule A.

3. “Date” means the exact day and time, month, and year if ascertainable, or if not, the best approximation (including relationship to other events).

4. “Defendants” include each and every defendant named in the Amended Complaint.

5. “Document(s)” shall have the full meaning ascribed to it in Rule 34 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Local Civil Rule 26.3(c), and for purposes of these Requests shall be deemed to include “electronically stored information” (“ESI”) as also defined in Rule 34. Examples of documents include, but are not limited to, all writings in any form, calendars, correspondence, diaries, manuals, memoranda, notes, log entries, reports, records, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, sound recordings, images, video recordings, telephone records, Bloomburghs, FINEST messages, electronic mail messages, telephonic text messages (including SMS and MMS, iMessages, WhatsApp messages and all instant messages sent and received by whatever means or platform), spreadsheets, databases, all other forms of electronic communication, and other data or data compilations of whatever nature stored in any medium (including those from which information can be obtained or translated if necessary into a reasonably useable form). For the avoidance of doubt, document(s) shall include all originals of any nature whatsoever and all non-identical copies thereof, whether different from the originals by reason of any notation made on such copies or otherwise.

6. “NYPD Officer” means any former or current uniformed member of the New York City Police Department.

INSTRUCTIONS

1. In addition to following the rules of construction in Rule 26.3(d) of the Local Civil Rules, whenever necessary to bring within the scope of these Requests Documents that might otherwise be construed to be outside its scope: (a) the use of a verb in any tense shall be construed as the use of that verb in all other tenses; and (b) the use of the feminine, masculine, or neuter genders shall include all genders.

2. No paragraph herein shall be construed with reference to any other paragraph for the purpose of limitation.

3. Unless otherwise indicated, the relevant time period for purposes of these Requests is between May 1, 2020, and the present.

4. All Documents shall be produced in the manner in which they are maintained in the usual course of business. A request for a Document shall be deemed to include a request for any and all file folders or binders within which the Document was contained, transmittal sheets, cover letters, exhibits, enclosures, or attachments to the Document in addition to the Document itself.

5. Any Request that calls for production of specific documents or forms where the information contained within such documents or forms is maintained in electronic databases or similar repositories, Plaintiff requests production of the underlying data in lieu of the documents or forms themselves, unless the documents or forms contain additional or unique information, in which case the Request encompasses both the underlying data and the documents and forms.

6. Provide all ESI in the forms and manner specified in the Parties’ agreed-upon production specifications.

7. In the event Defendants withhold any Document called for by these Requests on the basis of a claim of privilege, Defendants shall provide the information required by Rule 26.2 of the Local Civil Rules.

8. In the event that any Document called for by these Requests has been destroyed or discarded, Defendant shall provide an affidavit by a person with personal knowledge identifying the Document so lost, discarded, or destroyed as completely as possible, providing at least the following information: (i) the type of Document withheld; (ii) any author, addressor and/or addressee; (iii) any indicated or blind copy recipients; (iv) the Document's date, subject matter, number of pages, and attachments or appendices; (v) all persons to whom the Document was distributed, shown or explained; (vi) the Document's date of destruction or discard, manner of destruction or discard, and reason for destruction or discard; and (vii) the persons authorizing and carrying out such destruction or discard.

9. If objection is made to any of the Requests, the response shall state whether documents are being withheld from inspection and production on the basis of such objection, or whether inspection and production of the responsive Documents will occur notwithstanding such objection.

10. If there are no Documents responsive to any particular request, the response shall state so in writing.

11. These Requests are continuing in nature. In accordance with Rule 26(e) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Defendants are required promptly to serve supplementary responses and produce additional documents if Defendants obtain further or different information.

DOCUMENTS REQUESTED¹

Request No. 1:

Provide all Documents concerning the investigation, prosecution and/or resulting discipline of misconduct alleged to have occurred at any of the 2020 Racial Justice Protests that was investigated by the Civilian Complaint Review Board (“CCRB”), including those referenced in the CCRB’s May 2022 Protest Snapshot (**Exhibit A**) and/or involving any NYPD Officer listed in the chart at **Exhibit B**. These Documents shall include, but not be limited to:

- a. Complaint Reports;
- b. The entire CCRB investigative file, including but not limited to:
 - i. Investigative Actions and all other investigator notes;
 - ii. photographs, video and audio recordings, body-worn camera footage, telephone records, and text messages;
 - iii. UF-49s;
 - iv. requests made to the NYPD and responses from the NYPD; and
 - v. CCRB Investigative Recommendations by the investigating member of the CCRB and all supervisory and CCRB board member modifications thereto;
- c. Requests by the NYPD Police Commissioner to refrain from prosecution pursuant to the CCRB and NYPD Memorandum of Understanding and related communications;
- d. Requests by the Department Advocate’s Office (DAO) to reconsider a CCRB disciplinary recommendation and related communications;

¹ The People’s Third Supplemental Requests for Production served herein seeks documents previously requested by the consolidated plaintiffs in their First Consolidated Requests for Production and by the People in their First Supplemental Requests for Production. However, as Defendants continue to narrowly read those requests, Plaintiffs provide more detailed requests herein without waiver to seeking to compel production in response to their prior requests.

- e. Charges and Specifications (Form PD 468-121) and any related memoranda;
- f. CCRB requests for assistance from the Department Advocacy Office (“DAO”) and DAO responses to such requests;
- g. Status reports prepared by the CCRB on the administrative prosecution of individual officers;
- h. The trial folder of the Administrative Prosecution Unit (“APU”), including exhibits and trial transcripts;
- i. Department Trial filings and transcripts;
- j. Settlement offers, agreements, and endorsements;
- k. Documents concerning the NYPD’s acceptance, rejection, or modification of CCRB and APU recommendations or proposed penalty;
- l. Trial Commissioner’s findings, decision, and proposed penalty and related comments by the parties;
- m. Documents concerning the Police Commissioner’s review of the Trial Commissioner’s report and final disciplinary decision, including but not limited to memoranda justifying the discipline imposed and any deviation from the presumptive penalty.
- n. Requests by the Police Commissioner to further investigate and develop case records;
- o. “Fogel” letters;
- p. Disposition of Charges (Form PD 468-142); and
- q. Notifications of final disciplinary results.

Request No. 2:

For each instance of misconduct alleged to have occurred at any of the 2020 Racial Justice Protests and investigated by the NYPD (including the Internal Affairs Bureau (“IAB”), the Chief

of Department (“COD”), Department Advocate’s Office, Office of the Chief of the Department, Risk Management Bureau, Patrol Bureau Investigations, Force Investigation Division, and/or any other NYPD command), including allegations involving any of the NYPD Officers listed in the chart at **Exhibit B**, provide all Documents concerning the investigation, prosecution and/or resulting discipline of those incidents, including but not limited to:

- a. The complete investigative file, including but not limited to:
 - i. All Documents describing the allegations of misconduct;
 - ii. Case referral forms;
 - iii. Internal Case Management System Worksheets and documents referenced therein;
 - iv. Photographs and video and audio recordings;
 - v. Witness statements;
 - vi. UF-49s;
 - vii. Investigating Officer’s Reports (Form PD 313-153) and other investigator notes;
and
 - viii. Case Closing Disposition/Penalty Reports and all other Documents concerning
factual findings, case disposition, and recommendations for discipline;
- b. Command Discipline Election Reports;
- c. DAO case analysis and recommendation memoranda;
- d. The DAO trial folder, including exhibits and trial transcripts;
- e. Settlement offers, agreements, and endorsements;
- f. Department Trial filings and transcripts;
- g. Trial Commissioner’s findings, decision, and proposed penalty and related comments by
the parties;

- h. Endorsements regarding disciplinary cases and the approvals or disapprovals of such endorsements; and
- i. Documents concerning the Police Commissioner's review of the Trial Commissioner's report and final disciplinary decision, including but not limited to memoranda justifying the discipline imposed and any deviation from the presumptive penalty.

Request No. 3:

Provide all Documents concerning NYPD and CCRB investigations and administrative prosecutions of allegations of misconduct arising from the 2020 Racial Justice Protests for not yet known or named NYPD officers involved in incidents with the following civilians on the stated dates and at the stated locations:

- a. Luke Hanna on June 3, 2020, at Cadman Plaza;
- b. Hannah Lillevoy on May 28, 2020, near Union Square, Manhattan;
- c. Huascar Benoit on May 30, 2020, to May 31, 2022 in Brooklyn;
- d. Joseph Kokesh on May 29, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- e. Senator Zellnor Myrie on May 29, 2020, near Barclay's Center in Brooklyn;
- f. Assemblywoman Diana Richardson on May 29, 2020, near Barclay's Center in Brooklyn;
- g. Rayne Valentine on May 30, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- h. Patricia Delfin on May 29, 2020, in Clinton Hill, Brooklyn;
- i. John Doe I on May 30, 2020, at Bedford and Tilden Avenues in Brooklyn;²
- j. Kerry Leigh Pittenger on May 29, 2020, in Brooklyn;

² As described in the People's Amended Complaint, ¶¶ 235-236.

- k. Dorthley Beauval on June 1, 2020, near West 56th Street and Broadway in Manhattan;
- l. Dounya Zayer on May 29, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- m. Dennis Mullikin on May 31, 2020, in Manhattan;
- n. Rob Goyanes on June 4, 2020, in Mott Haven, Bronx;
- o. Dr. Mike Pappas on June 4, 2020, in Mott Haven, Bronx;
- p. Tameer Peak on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- q. Benjamine Heath on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- r. Blaise Johnson on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- s. Hillary Wright on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- t. Jonathan Peck on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- u. Marissa Kaiser on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- v. Steve Mazzucchi on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- w. Vanessa Turi on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- x. Ruwan Wijesooriya on January 18, 2021, near City Hall Park in Manhattan;
- y. Bryan Fielder on June 4, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- z. Kayley Berezney on June 4, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- aa. Marie Kahn on June 4, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- bb. Abel Tirado on November 4, 2020, in Manhattan;
- cc. Jillian Primiano on June 4, 2020, in Mott Haven, Bronx;
- dd. Dr. Marie DeLuca on June 4, 2020, in Mott Haven, Bronx;
- ee. Zuleyka Morales on June 2, 2020, on the West Side Highway in Manhattan;
- ff. Keith Boykin on May 30, 2020;
- gg. Jemell Cole on July 15, 2020, near Brooklyn Bridge;

- hh. Laisa Pertet on May 30, 2020, in Brooklyn
- ii. Alan Williams on May 29, 2020, ear Barclay's Center in Brooklyn;
- jj. Andrew Smith on May 30, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- kk. Lawrence Schober on May 31, 2020, in Manhattan;
- ll. Brian Anderson on May 29, 2020, in Brooklyn;
- mm. Jason "Jae" Donnelly on June 2, 2020, in Manhattan; and
- nn. Melanie Ryan on June 3, 2020, in Manhattan.

Dated: August 19, 2022

By: /s/ Lillian Marquez
Travis England, *Deputy Chief Attorney General*
Lillian Marquez, *Assistant Attorney General*
Swati Prakash, *Assistant Attorney General*
Gregory Morril, *Assistant Attorney General*
Colleen Faherty, *Assistant Attorney General*
Michelle Gonzalez, *Assistant Attorney General*
Gina Bull, *Assistant Attorney General*
Office of the New York State Attorney General
28 Liberty Street, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10005
Tel.: (212) 416-8250
Lillian.Marquez@ag.ny.gov

Amended Schedule A: List of Protest Locations¹

<u>Protest No.</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Approximate Location</u>	<u>Complaint Allegations</u>
1	May 28, 2020	Lafayette Street to City Hall, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 51 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 65
2	May 28, 2020	Union Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 128-132 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 44 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 65
3	May 29, 2020	Foley Square Manhattan to Near Barclays Center, Brooklyn via Brooklyn Bridge	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 52, 193-195, 196-202 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 45 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 65 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 45-47 <i>Rolon</i> , ¶ 105
4	May 29, 2020	Clinton Hill, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 52, 133-140, 223-226
5	May 29, 2020	Fort Greene, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 52
6	May 29, 2020	Bedford-Stuyvesant, Brooklyn (Herbert von King Park), Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 141-149, 161-163
7	May 29, 2020	Pacific Street and Flatbush Avenue, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 215-219 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 48-50 <i>Gray</i> ¶¶ 96-101
8	May 29, 2020	Union Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 52
9	May 29, 2020	Herald Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 52
10	May 30, 2020	Jackson Heights, Queens	<i>People</i> , ¶ 53
11	May 30, 2020	Park Slope, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 53
12	May 30, 2020	East Flatbush, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 53, 312-317 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 67
13	May 30, 2020	Near Bedford & Tilden Aves., Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 178-192, 235-236
14	May 30-31, 2020	Barclays Center to Flatbush Extension, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 203-207, 107-114 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 47-48, 107-115
15	May 30, 2020	Harlem / West Side Highway, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 402-407
16	May 30, 2020	Union Square to FDR Drive/Lower East Side, Manhattan	<i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 50, 117-123 <i>Sow</i> , ¶¶ 130-151

¹ The allegations listed in this table reference those in the Amended Complaints in *People*, No. 21 Civ. 322 (ECF No. 51), *Payne*, No. 20 Civ. 8224 (ECF No. 54), *Sierra*, No. 20 Civ. 10291 (ECF No. 38), *Sow*, 21 Civ. 533 (ECF No. 49) *Wood*, 20 Civ. 10541 (ECF No. 48), *Gray*, 20 Civ. 8924 (ECF No. 31) and the Complaints *Hernandez*, No. 21 Civ. 7406 (ECF No. 1) and *Rolon*, No. 21 Civ. 2548 (ECF No. 1). The allegations related to *Yates*, which is no longer active, have been deleted.

<u>Protest No.</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Approximate Location</u>	<u>Complaint Allegations</u>
			<i>Gray</i> , ¶¶ 58-65
17	May 30, 2020	City Hall to Brooklyn Bridge, Manhattan	<i>Sow</i> , ¶¶ 152-177
18	May 31, 2020	Near Barclays Center, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 54 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 68
19	May 31, 2020	Downtown Brooklyn to multiple bridges	<i>People</i> , ¶ 54
20	May 31, 2020	Brooklyn Bridge	<i>People</i> , ¶ 54
21	May 31, 2020	From Manhattan Bridge to Chinatown, Church Avenue, and/or across Canal Street, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 54 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 51-54 <i>Gray</i> ¶¶ 80-84
22	May 31, 2020	Near Williamsburg Bridge, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 54
23	May 31, 2020	Broadway to E. 11 th St. & Near Union Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 155-160, 231-234 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 125-130
24	May 31, 2020	Times Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 54
25	May 31, 2020	F.D.R. Drive, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 208-210
26	June 1, 2020	Midtown, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 55, 227-230 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 53 <i>Sow</i> , ¶¶ 208-219 <i>Rolon</i> , ¶84
27	June 1, 2020	East Village, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 55
28	June 1, 2020	Near Union Square Park, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 55 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 53
28.1	June 1, 2020	440 Broadway, Manhattan	<i>Gray</i> , ¶¶ 80-84
29	June 1, 2020	Near Barclays Center, Brooklyn, Crossing Manhattan Bridge into Times Square & Near Port Authority, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 55 <i>Sow</i> , ¶¶ 180-206
30	June 1, 2020	Fordham Manor, Bronx	<i>People</i> , ¶ 55
31	June 1, 2020	Astoria Park, Queens	<i>People</i> , ¶ 55
32	June 1, 2020	Flushing, Queens	<i>People</i> , ¶ 55
33	June 2, 2020	Lower Manhattan/Foley Square to Central Park, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 56, 318-323 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 131-136 <i>Gray</i> , ¶¶ 74-79
34	June 2, 2020	Union Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 56
35	June 2, 2020	Near Barclays Center, Brooklyn to Manhattan Bridge	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 330-336
36	June 2, 2020	Upper West Side, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 56, 423-430
37	June 2, 2020	Astor Place, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 56
38	June 2, 2020	Chelsea, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 56 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 54

<u>Protest No.</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Approximate Location</u>	<u>Complaint Allegations</u>
39	June 2, 2020	Near West Side Highway, Manhattan	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 54 <i>Sow</i> , ¶¶ 220-237, 239-282
40	June 2, 2020	Bryant Park to Midtown, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 57 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 55-59
41	June 3, 2020	Cadman Plaza, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 57, 164-168, 337-346 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 55, 143-159 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 83 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 65-66
42	June 3, 2020	Maria Hernandez Park, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 57
43	June 3, 2020	Midtown East/Upper East Side, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 57, 237-246, 347-354 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 84-85, 284-309 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 60-64
44	June 4, 2020	Mott Haven, Bronx	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 58, 169-170, 247-255, 284-310, 366-387 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 116-167 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 59-65, 161-173, 182-192, 194-200 <i>Sierra</i> , ¶¶ 41-124 <i>Sow</i> , ¶¶ 86-93, 310-329, 332-345, 348-390, 392-418 <i>Rolon</i> , ¶121 <i>Hernandez</i> , ¶¶ 1-12, 61-421
45	June 4, 2020	McCarren Park to South Williamsburg, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 355-365 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 58, 202-206 <i>Wood</i> , ¶¶ 67-68 <i>Sow</i> , ¶ 84-85
46	June 4, 2020	Clinton Hill and Prospect Heights, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 59
47	June 4, 2020	Flatbush, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 59
48	June 4, 2020	Brooklyn Bridge	<i>People</i> , ¶ 59
49	June 4, 2020	Midtown, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 59
50	June 4, 2020	Flushing, Queens	<i>People</i> , ¶ 59
51	June 4, 2020	Central Park West, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 59
52	June 5, 2020	Crown Heights, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 60
53	June 5, 2020	Sunset Park, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 60
54	June 5, 2020	Staten Island	<i>People</i> , ¶ 60
55	June 5, 2020	Near Gracie Mansion, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 60

<u>Protest No.</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Approximate Location</u>	<u>Complaint Allegations</u>
56	June 5, 2020	Barclays Center to Downtown Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 60
57	June 5, 2020	Nostrand Ave., Brooklyn	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 71
58	June 6, 2020	Financial District, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 61
59	June 7, 2020	Upper East Side, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 61
60	June 8, 2020	Times Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 61
61	June 14, 2020	Times Square, Manhattan	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 74
62	June 28, 2020	Foley Square to West Village, Manhattan (incl. Washington Square Park)	<i>People</i> , ¶ 62 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 78, 174-180, 209-210
63	June 23-30, 2020	City Hall Park, Manhattan	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 74
64	July 3, 2020	City Hall Park, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 63
65	July 11, 2020	Dyker Heights, Brooklyn	<i>Sow</i> , ¶ 101
66	July 12, 2020	Bay Ridge, Brooklyn	<i>Sow</i> , ¶ 102
67	July 15, 2020	Brooklyn Bridge Pedestrian Path	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 408-421 <i>Gray</i> , ¶¶ 66-73
67.1	July 21, 2020	City Hall Plaza	
67.2	July 25, 2020	Beach 101 St., Queens to Grand Army Plaza, Brooklyn	
68	July 28, 2020	Kips Bay, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 64
68.1	July 28, 2020	Columbus Park, Manhattan to Grand Army Plaza, Brooklyn	
69	September 11, 2020	McCarren Park, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 65
69.1	September 12, 2020	4295 Broadway, Manhattan	<i>Rolon</i> ¶130
70	September 17, 2020	Foley Square, Manhattan	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 76
70.1	September 18, 2020	26 Federal Plaza, Manhattan to McCarren Park, Brooklyn	
71	September 19, 2020	Times Square, Manhattan	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 77
72	September 26, 2020	Washington Square Park and Near Sixth Precinct Stationhouse, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 66
73	October 6, 2020	Borough Park, Brooklyn	<i>Sow</i> , ¶ 103
74	October 7, 2020	Bedford-Stuyvesant, Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 67
74.1	October 21, 2020	740 Park Avenue, Manhattan to Carl Schurz Park, Manhattan	

<u>Protest No.</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Approximate Location</u>	<u>Complaint Allegations</u>
75	October 25, 2020	Coney Island, Brooklyn to near Trump Tower, Manhattan, to Brooklyn Park	<i>Sow</i> , ¶ 104
75.1	October 25, 2020	40th Pct. Stationhouse, Bronx to Carl Schurz Park, Manhattan	
76	November 1, 2020	Hell's Kitchen, Manhattan	<i>Sow</i> , ¶ 105
77	November 4, 2020	Washington Square Park, W. 8 th and Greenwich Ave., Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 68, 388-389
78	November 4, 2020	Central Park to Union Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 68, 390-393 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 78
79	November 5, 2020	West Village to Union Square, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶ 69 <i>Payne</i> , ¶ 79
80	December 2, 2020	Staten Island	<i>Sow</i> , ¶ 106
81	December 11, 2020	Downtown Brooklyn	<i>People</i> , ¶ 70
82	January 12-16, 2021	Downtown Brooklyn	<i>Payne</i> , ¶ 138
83	January 18, 2021	Barclays Center, Brooklyn to City Hall Park, Manhattan	<i>People</i> , ¶¶ 71, 112-113 394-398 <i>Payne</i> , ¶¶ 80, 139-140 <i>Rolon</i> , ¶144
84	February 12, 2021	Manhattan, Midtown near 54th street and 6th avenue	<i>Rolon</i> , ¶136

EXHIBIT A



CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

ERIC L. ADAMS, Mayor

ARVA RICE, Interim Chair

JONATHAN DARCHE, Esq. Executive Director

CCRB 2020 PROTEST DATA SNAPSHOT – MAY 11, 2022

The CCRB received over 750 complaints relating to the behavior of NYPD officers at the Black Lives Matter protests over the summer.

Those complaints resulted in 321 complaints containing over 2,000 allegations that fall within CCRB's jurisdiction covering over 500 identified members of service. Since last summer, the CCRB has been working diligently to thoroughly investigate these complaints.

The CCRB has seen unprecedented challenges in investigating these complaints particularly around the identification of officers due to the failure to follow proper protocols, officers covering their names and shield, officers wearing protective equipment that did not belong to them, the lack of proper use of body worn cameras, as well as incomplete and severely delayed paperwork.

PROTEST COMPLAINTS	FULL INVESTIGATIONS	PENDING INVESTIGATIONS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 321 total complaints - 5 pending - 316 closed - 223 full investigations - 28 closed pending litigation - 62 truncations - 3 closed other 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 223 full investigations - 87 substantiations - 17 exonerations - 49 unsubstantiations - 59 officers unidentified - 11 unfounded 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 5 open investigations - 1 on DA Hold - 3 containing Force allegations that may entail a statutory SOL exemption - 1 containing no recommended substantiated allegations
SUBSTANTIATED MISCONDUCT		
<p>So far, the CCRB has substantiated 87 complaints of misconduct containing 267 allegations against 145 officers. The Board has recommended serving Charges for 88 officers, Command Discipline B for 26 officers, and Command Discipline A for 31 officers. The current substantiation rate in fully investigated protest complaints is 39%.</p> <p>The NYPD has finalized 44 cases and imposed discipline against 18 officers.</p>		

#	OFFICER	RANK	PENALTY RECOMMENDED	FADO TYPE	PENALTY IMPOSED ¹
1	RICHARD ACCARDI	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	
2	JUSTIN ADETIMIRIN	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	F	NO DISCIPLINE
3	GLEN ALAVA	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
4	ALFREDO ALBA	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	
5	ADIB ALGAHITI	PO	CHARGES	D/O	
6	LUIS ALICEA	PO	CHARGES	A	RETIRED
7	DANIEL ALVAREZ	PO	CHARGES	F	
8	EVAN ANGELS	PO	CHARGES	F	NO DISCIPLINE
9	MATTHEW ANSBRO	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
10	BILAL ATEES	SGT	CHARGES	F	
11	RYAN BRADLEY	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
12	KEITH BRYAN	SGT	CHARGES	F	
13	ANTHONY BUONOMO	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
14	MICHAEL BUTLER	LT	CHARGES	F	
15	KYLE CALEDA	PO	CHARGES	F	
16	ANDREW CAMPBELL	SGT	CHARGES	F/U	
17	ANTHONY CAROLEI	PO	CHARGES	F/A/U	
18	CHRISTOPHER CATALANO	SGT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
19	STEPHEN CENTORE ²	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	D/O	
20	STEPHEN CENTORE	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	
21	STEPHEN CENTORE	PO	CHARGES	F	
22	WON CHANG	DET	CHARGES	O/U	RETIRED
23	JIANWEI CHEN	PO	CHARGES	U	
24	KACHUN CHEUNG	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
25	DANIEL CHIN	PO	CHARGES	F/A/D/U	
26	CHRISTIAN CHIQUI	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
27	AMEL CIRIKOVIC	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	FORMALIZED TRAINING
28	JESSICA CLINTON	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	F	
29	JASON CORTES	LT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	
30	STEVEN COUNIHAN	SGT	CHARGES	F/A	
31	JOHN DADAMO	DC	CHARGES	F	
32	ALFRED DAVIDSON	DET	CHARGES	F	
33	YURIY DEMCHENKO	PO	CHARGES	F	
34	JOSEPH DONATO	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
35	JONATHAN DONES	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
36	GERARD DOWLING	INS	CHARGES	F	
37	ERIC DYM	LT	CHARGES	F/A	
38	MICHAEL ECKERLE	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	

¹ A blank entry indicates that the disciplinary decision is pending.

² Misconduct was substantiated against Stephen Centore in three separate complaints.

#	OFFICER	RANK	PENALTY RECOMMENDED	FADO TYPE	PENALTY IMPOSED ¹
39	MOHAMED ELHANAFI	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
40	ANTHONY FERNANDEZ	DET	CHARGES	F	
41	FRANK FIORENZA	PO	CHARGES	F	
42	ROBERT FISHER	CPT	CHARGES	A	
43	ANDREW FITTS	SGT	CHARGES	F/U	
44	THOMAS FORONJY ³	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
45	THOMAS FORONJY	PO	CHARGES	A/D	
46	ANDRE GADDY	PO	CHARGES	F	
47	EVANGELOS GALATAS	PO	CHARGES	O	
48	JOSHUA GARCIA	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
49	JOSEPH GUARINI	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
50	VINCENT HARRIS	PO	CHARGES	F/A	NO DISCIPLINE
51	ALI HASSAN	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F/U	NO DISCIPLINE
52	FRITZ HECTOR	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	
53	CHRISTOPHER HEWITSON	SGT	CHARGES	F/A/U	
54	ANDREW HILLERY	DI	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	
55	LIOSMELY HOLGUIN	PO	CHARGES	F/U	
56	ADNAN HUSSAIN	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
57	JOSHUA JIMINEZ	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
58	COREY JOHNSON	PO	CHARGES	F/U	
59	ROBERT KLEIN	DET	CHARGES	D/O	
60	MICHAEL KOVALIK	PO	CHARGES	A	
61	EVGENY KRAMAR	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
62	DAVID LAMARRE	SGT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	NO DISCIPLINE
63	JOHN LAMNECK	PO	CHARGES	D/O	
64	JESSE LANCE	INS	CHARGES	F/U	
65	TOBY LAU	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - B
66	ENRICO LAURETTA	PO	CHARGES	O	
67	BRIAN MAHON	PO	CHARGES	F/U	
68	JOHNNY MARQUEZ ⁴	PO	CHARGES	F/U	
69	JOHNNY MARQUEZ	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
70	ANTONIO MARTINEZ	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
71	VERONICA MARTINO	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
72	JAMES MCCARTHY	DC	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
73	MALIK MCCLOUD	PO	CHARGES	F/A	

³ Misconduct was substantiated against Thomas Foronjy in two separate complaints.

⁴ Misconduct was substantiated against Johnny Marquez in two separate complaints.

#	OFFICER	RANK	PENALTY RECOMMENDED	FADO TYPE	PENALTY IMPOSED ¹
74	CRAIG MCGRATH ⁵	PO	CHARGES	F	FORFEIT VACATION: 10 DAYS
75	ADAM MELLUSI	LT	CHARGES	F	
76	DANIEL MENDEZ	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	F	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
77	ANTHONY MESA	PO	CHARGES	F	
78	JOHN MIGLIACCIO ⁶	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
79	JOHN MIGLIACCIO	PO	CHARGES	F	
80	MICHAEL MILLER	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
81	ANTHONY MISIANO	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
82	DESEAN MULLINGS	PO	CHARGES	U	
83	WILLIAM MYHRE	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
84	LUIS NEGRON	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
85	DANIEL NICOLETTI	SGT	CHARGES	F/U	
86	JOSEPH NICOLETTI	PO	CHARGES	F	WARNED AND ADMONISHED
87	ELIAS NIKAS	DI	CHARGES	A	
88	OSVALDO NUNEZ	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	F	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
89	JOHN OCONNELL	CPT	CHARGES	F	
90	ROBERT OHARE	DI	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
91	JOSEPH ORLANDO	PO	CHARGES	F/U	
92	MARTIN ORTIZ	PO	CHARGES	U	
93	STEVEN ORTIZ	INS	CHARGES	A	NO DISCIPLINE
94	KATHERINE OSIPOWICH	PO	CHARGES	U	
95	ZACHARY PALLADINO	PO	CHARGES	A	
96	MICHAEL PALMESE	PO	CHARGES	A/D	
97	JAMES PALUMBO	INSP	CHARGES	F	
98	BRANDON PATANE	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
99	STEPHEN PATTI	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
100	JONATHAN PENA	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
101	MATTHEW PETERS	SGT	CHARGES	F	
102	JUSTIN PICHON	PO	CHARGES	F	
103	CHRISTOPHER PIERRE	PO	CHARGES	F	
104	MICHAEL PILECKI	DC	CHARGES	A	
105	DYNEL POWELL	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	O	NO DISCIPLINE
106	JASON RAGOO	DET	CHARGES	F	INSTRUCTIONS
107	RONALD RAMOS	CPT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
108	NICHOLAS RIOS	PO	CHARGES	F/A	

⁵ This case was adjudicated by NYPD prior to the issuance of charges and was not prosecuted by CCRB.

⁶ Misconduct was substantiated against John Migliaccio in two separate complaints.

#	OFFICER	RANK	PENALTY RECOMMENDED	FADO TYPE	PENALTY IMPOSED ¹
109	DANIEL RIVERA	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	A	
110	HANSEL ROCHA	PO	CHARGES	F	
111	JAN ROGOWSKI	PO	CHARGES	F/U	
112	ARTHUR ROLDAN	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	
113	DANNY ROMERO	PO	CHARGES	U	
114	ROBERT RUFRANO	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	FORMALIZED TRAINING
115	ANTHONY RUGGIERO	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	F	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
116	RAMIRO RUIZ	SGT	CHARGES	F/A	
117	MAJER SALEH	SGT	CHARGES	F	
118	ANDREY SAMUSEV	PO	CHARGES	F	
119	SINDY SANCHEZ	SGT	CHARGES	F	
120	CHRISTOPHER SCHMIDT	LT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	NO DISCIPLINE
121	ANTHONY SCLAFANI	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
122	JUNIOR SESAY	DET	CHARGES	A/U	
123	TARIK SHEPPARD	CPT	CHARGES	F	NO DISCIPLINE
124	MICHAEL SHER	PO	CHARGES	F/A/D	
125	JAMES SHOULDIS	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
126	EDUARDO SILVA	LT	CHARGES	F	
127	STEVE SILVERSTEIN	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	
128	ISAAC SOBERAL	CPT	CHARGES	F	
129	RAY SORIANO	PO	CHARGES	F	
130	ANTONY STEVENS	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	
131	ADAN SUAZORODAS	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
132	JOSEPH TAYLOR ⁷	CPT	CHARGES	D/U	
133	JOSEPH TAYLOR	CPT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	
134	JOSEPH TAYLOR	CPT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	D	
135	CHRISTOPHER TREUBIG	CPT	CHARGES	A/D	
136	MOHAMMED UDDIN	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE A	A	COMMAND DISCIPLINE - A
137	CURTIS VALLEY	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F/A/D	RETIRED
138	MIGUEL VANBRAKLE	PO	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	NO DISCIPLINE
139	JEROME VICTOR	DET	CHARGES	F	
140	JOEL WITRIOL	LT	CHARGES	F	
141	ROBERT WONG	SGT	CHARGES	F	NO DISCIPLINE
142	MATEUSZ WYBRANIEC	PO	CHARGES	F/A	
143	VITALIY ZELIKOV	CPT	CHARGES	F	
144	ELLIOT ZINSTEIN ⁸	SGT	CHARGES	F	
145	ELLIOT ZINSTEIN	SGT	COMMAND DISCIPLINE B	F	

⁷ Misconduct was substantiated against Joseph Taylor in three separate complaints.

⁸ Misconduct was substantiated against Elliot Zinstein in two separate complaints.

EXHIBIT B

Officer Name	Tax ID (or Shield Number where specified)
Capt. John O'Connell	937204
Capt. Joseph B. Taylor	924542
Capt. Vitaliy Zelikov	936353
Deputy Inspector Craig E. Edelman	932592
DTS Craig Jacob	935049
Lt. Eduardo Silva	933356
Lt. Michael T. Butler	948725
Sgt. Patrick Quigley	934081
Police Officer Ayala	941377
Police Officer Brian DeStefano	954727
Police Officer Daniel Tooma	Shield ID 24945
Police Officer Jessica Clinton	960376
Police Officer Michael Sher	951244
Police Officer Niazul Haque	943349
Police Officer Ronny Vega	951381
Police Officer Vincent D'Andraia	957510
Sergeant Majer Saleh	929110
Sergeant Michael Cozier	943112
Police Officer Oscar Palomino	
Det. Kenneth Rice	952164
Police Officer Michael Kovalik	948368
Sgt. Mitchell Epstein	954774
Police Officer Jarvis Onabanjo	959010
Police Officer James Lee	Shield 19325

Police Officer Luis Ortiz	956142
Police Officer Malik McCloud	954114
Lt. Eric Dym	933762
PO John Migliaccio	964169
Sgt. Steven Counihan	952620
Police Officer Frank Fiorenza	957588
Sgt. Christopher Catalano	936323
PO Patrick Connolly	930038
Sgt. Elliot Zinstein	947634
Det. Chad Mack	937000
Sgt. David Lamarre	947929
Sergeant Michael Ciota	936356
PO Miguel Salgado	951197
Reynaldo Gonzalez	923898
Sali Cerimi	965974
Pavlo Azarov	953647
Captain Isaac Soberal	943830
Sgt. Sindy Sanchez	939761
PO Victoria Hurcey	
PO Frederick Alleyne	
PO Edwin Nieves	
PO Kontarinis	
Sgt. Christopher Hewitson	917756
PO Miguel Vanbrackle	955616
PO Mohamed Elhanafi	955897
PO Thomas Bay	960217
PO Brandon Patane	961077
PO Ricardo Martinez	950834